



**THE RAMPHAL CENTRE**  
SOCIETIES | ECONOMIES | ENVIRONMENT | GOVERNANCE

1. **Summary Report on Consultation for the Ramphal Commission on Migration and Development, University of Warwick, 29-30 October, 2009**
2. **Agenda**
3. **List of persons attending**
4. **Agreed terms of reference following Warwick consultation**



# THE RAMPHAL CENTRE

SOCIETIES | ECONOMIES | ENVIRONMENT | GOVERNANCE

## **1. Summary Report on Consultation for the Ramphal Commission on Migration and Development, University of Warwick, 29-30 October, 2009**

### *Background*

The Ramphal Centre was established in 2008 as an independent intellectual point of contact for the Commonwealth. Through the facilitation of high quality analysis and the promotion of new ideas, it will assist member states in their efforts to meet the environmental and development challenges which they face in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. It will be a catalyst for progressive change. It will meet the challenge which Commonwealth Secretary-General Kamalesh Sharma has described as; the need for all who support the idea of the Commonwealth to find ways in which its collective wisdom can be translated into action now, to benefit the global community.

Its chief tool for promoting fresh thinking will be the high-level commission, to investigate difficult contemporary issues of public policy. Each Ramphal Commission will, following study and consultation, make recommendations to governments, business, civil society and public opinion. In this it will reflect the Commonwealth and international contributions of Sir Shridath Ramphal, after whom the Centre is named.

In 2009, the Centre announced the establishment of its first commission, the Ramphal Commission on Migration and Development, and the appointment of the Hon PJ Patterson, former Prime Minister of Jamaica, as chairman. Last October 2009, a two-day consultation on priorities for the work of the commission was held at the Scarman Conference Centre, Warwick University. This aimed to identify issues around migration of particular interest to the Commonwealth and to the development of its member states. It focused on potential terms of reference for the commission.

The discussions were led by the chairman, assisted by Commissioner Farooq Sobhan - Director of Bangladesh Enterprise Institute and former Foreign Secretary for Bangladesh. Also present were representatives from the International Organisation on Migration; the Department for International Development (DFID); the United Nations; the International Monetary Fund; the Commonwealth Secretariat; University College, London; Warwick University; University of KwaZulu-Natal, Nairobi Centre for Migration Research; the All India Federation of Teachers Organisations Oxfam; the Commonwealth Foundation; DFID; the Shridath Ramphal Centre for International Trade Law, Policy and Services; University of Lagos and HSBC bank.

The consultation covered several relevant issues, in particular the impact of global recession, climate change and the role of the diaspora, remittances, circulation of people and restrictions on migration. Differences of approach among Commonwealth governments which may affect the ability of the Commonwealth and its member states to take forward the recommendations of this Ramphal Commission were reviewed, and work on terms of reference was carried out. Agreed terms of reference, circulated to Commissioners unable to be present at Warwick, and approved by the Ramphal Centre Committee on 19 November 2009, are attached.

### *Work of the Commission*

The consensus at the consultation was that the Commission should define the links between migration and development, and promote a more balanced approach to the topic in Commonwealth member states and internationally. It must take a clear ethical stance, because of the human rights and other challenges facing governments and peoples everywhere. In fact, while the political dimension was obvious and important, the moral question was equally pressing. The need for a vision statement on migration over the next decades was identified, with special emphasis on the development of policies to reduce poverty. There should be a comprehensive examination of the links between migration and poverty, in terms of the Millennium Development Goals.

There was a general agreement at the consultation that the commission must base its work on reliable evidence and research. At present, there is a lack internationally of much information about the types and levels of migration. The need for data is now so acute that the establishment of a research institute on migration, which might complement the work of the International Organisation for Migration and other bodies, should be considered.

The commission should note the migration policies of important receiving countries. It must address the concerns of Commonwealth member governments, both sending and receiving, and acknowledge that many states both send and receive. Regular and irregular migration have become topical political issues in many countries, exacerbated by the world recession, and resistance to migration has been increasing among the general population. Yet controlling migration, in an era of easy international transport, has become increasingly difficult. Governments are meeting increasing challenges in trying to operate migration policies.

In some countries, even where migration was not a central policy issue, there was concern about the need to protect the rights of migrants and vulnerable populations. There is an urgent need for a mature international dialogue on migration management. Participants continuously stressed the lack of evidence. Objective information and data are now paramount needs. The commission should seek support for this, at the national and international levels.

While the commission should have regard for general issues surrounding international migration, it should also focus on small and fragile states, which are in grave need of advice and assistance on how to manage migration. For instance, countries in the Caribbean were losing as much as 70% of people educated to the tertiary level. Meanwhile because of the impact of environmental stress and climate change, many countries in the Commonwealth

are facing serious problems. Bangladesh for instance recognises that, in the coming years, at least 5 million people may be forced to leave their country because of environmental factors. Citizens of small Pacific and Indian Ocean states may have to abandon their islands altogether, because of rising sea levels. The Environmental Justice Foundation estimates that there could be 150M climate refugees by 2050, and that 10% of the planet's human population are at risk of internal displacement from extreme climate change.

In carrying out its mandate, the commission should take into account work already being done in this field by the United Nations, the Global Forum on Migration, the South Asia Migration Commission and other international bodies, including the Commonwealth Secretariat. There is already a wide body of important research on migration issues and the commission should prioritise analysis of material already available, and realistic policy options. It should address the specific niche role which the Commonwealth might occupy. Policy is already shifting in labour recruiting countries: for instance the points-based system recently adopted by some member states has impeded the migration of unskilled workers, yet a pro-poor development agenda ascribes a high value to the remittances and skills training of the unskilled. There are also huge migration flows involving Commonwealth and non-Commonwealth countries, for instance from the Indian sub-continent to the Gulf States, and from Eastern to Western Europe.

Finally, the major result of the commission's work should be a comprehensive set of recommendations for policy makers and the public. It must open up consideration of sensitive migration issues on a Commonwealth-wide basis, and encourage free and frank discussions, particularly in relation to the media where perceptions are often hostile to immigration, and there is ignorance of emigration except at times of brain drain panic. It should prepare a call for action, design a blueprint to enhance human development, and define coherent pro-poor migration policies. There has to be a rigorous examination of the capacity of member states to deliver improved migration policies, and advice to them on how to strengthen this capacity, institutionally, financially and technically. The target for the commission's report should not only be the meeting of Commonwealth leaders in Perth, Australia, in late 2011, but also the agendas of international groupings such as the G20 and the United Nations family.

### *Role of the Commonwealth*

The Commonwealth is intended to have the key role in implementing the recommendations of the commission. It has had a long commitment to democracy and development, and to pro-poor policies. These attributes give it a significant advantage, not only in carrying forward the findings of the commission but in its ability to promote cooperation, coherent policies and capacity building in member states.

Its other advantages include the diversity of its membership, its unparalleled convening power, its decades old ability to promote and reach consensus on difficult international issues, its capacity to advocate at the highest levels globally, and its lattice-work of networks which encompasses all levels of society – public, private and civil. Its membership includes some of the major sending and receiving countries of migrants worldwide. It was therefore essential that the commission should focus on what this family of nations can do to meet this major international challenge.

The view was expressed that the task of the Commonwealth was to give migration a human face and the question was posed: can the Commonwealth help to reduce political pressures on receiving countries and help to diffuse the gathering xenophobia and inaccuracy in the media? The question of race, as well as gender and class cannot be ignored and there was a special role for the Commonwealth in this regard, particularly in the area of cultural retention by indigenous and immigrant communities. The Commonwealth's work on promoting respect and understanding in its diverse societies – as exemplified in the 2007 report "Civil Paths to Peace" -- should enable it to promote practical ideas for tackling xenophobia, and handling controversial issues.

The official Commonwealth is intended to be the channel through which the commission's recommendations, supported by research and analysis, will be forwarded to member governments. The role of the Commonwealth family is essential, but the influence and impact of the commission should reach countries outside its membership of 54 states. While the terms of reference must reflect Commonwealth priorities, the commission's work should not be limited by geography, and should strive to influence non-Commonwealth players.

### *Issues surrounding migration*

Human Capital : The loss of human capital and human development should not be ignored, and the commission will have to look at the causes and negative aspects of the brain drain from many countries. There was already in place a Commonwealth Teacher Recruitment Protocol ( CTRP ), designed to stem unfair recruitment practices by developed countries, while also protecting the rights of teachers to migrate. Some small developing countries have lost too many expensively trained maths and science teachers. A similar code exists for health professionals. A statistic cited by one participant revealed that there are now more Ghanaian doctors in Manchester, England, than in Ghana. The commission will need to investigate the effectiveness of sectoral Commonwealth measures such as the CTRP, and whether they might be extended.

Also identified was the factor described as brain waste, where highly skilled and educated people are recruited for jobs well below their knowledge and expertise. This devaluation of human resources where qualifications were not respected was a significant problem, especially as it was estimated that by 2018, 18 million qualified teachers will be migrating globally. The possibility of widespread exploitation of qualified migrants and the need for ethical recruitment policies to meet the demand for workers should not be ignored. The loss of skilled people also had a noticeable impact on taxes, and pension funds in sending countries.

Xenophobia : The increase in migration worldwide has led to a definite rise in xenophobia and the view in host communities of migrants as "grabbers," who resist integration into the host community. These attitudes were often media-led, amplified fears in poor communities receiving migrants, and had a negative impact on diversity and social cohesion in many societies.

Diaspora and Remittances : Remittances by diaspora communities were identified as another crucial area to be examined. Remittances, diasporic investment, and the trade generated by diasporas are highly significant, but more analysis is required. While

remittances were now an important component in many national budgets, there can be serious social consequences. Some communities have developed a mendicant culture, where families give up work as they wait for money and goods from relations abroad. The loss of skilled people was an undoubted per capita disadvantage which impacted on tax revenues and pensions funds in sending countries, particularly as these foreign exchange payments are not routed through national treasuries. Any analysis of migration policies should be linked to labour policy analyses, with inducements to link skills in the diaspora more effectively with the needs of sending countries.

The commission should also look at the high cost of remittances and the need for quicker and cheaper services. The cost of remittances varied widely and sample costs presented at the consultation were as follows: Canada to Jamaica : 15%; Singapore to Malaysia: 5%; South Africa to Zambia:25%.

An examination should be made of systems where remittances are based on trust; mobile telephony transfers are growing. Banks and micro-finance institutions should be encouraged to engage with remittance senders in an effort to utilise the entrepreneurial interests of diaspora communities to benefit their countries of origin. The commission should see the diaspora as a resource for building knowledge, and an aspect where migration can enhance development.

#### Opportunities

The commission should also look at the opportunities for development created by migration. As one participant remarked, "The decision to migrate across a border is, for the individual concerned, a development decision." Globalisation is opening up new insights, for trade, travel and the communication of ideas ; population balances are altering where more citizens from some smaller countries , and their descendants, live outside a country than those who remain behind.

*Patsy Robertson*  
*Chair, Ramphal Centre Committee*  
*November 2009*

## **2. Agenda**

### **Consultation for the Ramphal Commission on Migration and Development at Warwick University, 29-30 October, 2009**

#### *Agenda Outline*

The purposes of this two day meeting, in the Scarman Room at Warwick University, are to:  
Focus priorities for an international inquiry on Migration and Development, of particular interest to the Commonwealth, and to the development of its member states  
Consider relevant issues, including the impact of global recession, climate change, and the roles of diaspora, remittances, circulations of people and restrictions on migration  
Review differences of approach amongst Commonwealth governments which may affect the ability of the Commonwealth and its member states to take forward the recommendations of this Ramphal Commission  
Agree terms of reference for the Commission  
Agree modalities – timescale, rough budget, interaction with Commonwealth and other agencies, collection of evidence, consultancy, use of IT to collect ideas and win support  
Take precautions to maximise the chances of successful impact – public relations, responsibility of Commissioners, support by a small servicing nucleus in the Ramphal Centre, London

The consultation will take place under Chatham House rules, in order to stimulate the frank exchange of ideas.

#### **Thursday, 29 October 2009: Overviews and Priorities**

10.30 am	Coffee, tea and registration
11.00 am	Welcome by <b>Mrs Patsy Robertson</b> , chair, Ramphal Centre Committee and introduction of <b>Hon P J Patterson</b> , lately Prime Minister of Jamaica and Chairman, Ramphal Commission on Migration and Development

- 11.30 am *Priorities, as currently seen by the Commonwealth Secretariat and political issues within the Commonwealth*  
**Dr Cyrus Rustomjee** - Director, Economic Affairs Division, Commonwealth Secretariat
- 12noon *Priorities, as currently seen by international agencies*  
**Meera Sethi** - Senior Regional Adviser for South Asia, External Relations Department, International Organisation for Migration, Geneva.  
**Bela Hovy** - Chief of Migration Section UN Population Division New York, NY
- 12.30 pm *Discussion, moderated by Professor Nigel Harris, University College, London*
- 1 - 2 pm Lunch
- 2.00 pm *Priorities, as seen from African developing countries*  
**Professor John Ocho**, Marie Curie Chair, Centre for Research in Ethnic Relations School of Health and Social Studies Warwick University and the Nairobi Centre for Migration Research
- 2.30 pm *Priorities, as seen from South Asia*  
**Mr Farooq Sobhan** - Patron of the Ramphal Centre and Commissioner, Ramphal Commission on Migration and Development
- 3 – 4 pm *Discussion, moderated by the Hon P J Patterson*
- 4 – 4.30 pm Tea
- 4.30-5.30pm *Perspectives on migration and development as seen from the UK development community*  
**Bella Bird** – Head of the Governance and Social Development Group in DFID  
**Gonzalo Fanjul** - Senior Policy Advisor at Oxfam International
- 6pm Drinks Reception
- 7 pm Dinner

**Friday 30 October: Business interest, terms of reference, practicalities and effectiveness**

- 9 – 10 am            Commercial interests in Migration and Development  
**Alan Smith**, HSBC *Diaspora, Migration and remittances*
- 10- 11 am            ***Discussion on terms of reference for the Commission Chaired by the Hon P J Patterson***
- 11–11.30am            Coffee and tea break
- 11.30-12.15pm      *How to win support for the Commission and its recommendations, and how to avoid disappointment*  
**Richard Bourne**, Secretary, Ramphal Centre Committee
- 12.15 – 1 pm        ***Discussion of logistical considerations – timescale, evidence gathering, consultancy support, budgetary requirements***
- 1 pm                  *Formal closure of consultation*  
**Hon P J Patterson and Richard Bourne**
- 1.15 pm              Lunch and departure

*The Ramphal Centre, London, responsible for organising the Ramphal Commission on Migration and Development, would like to record its thanks to the Commonwealth Secretariat and the Commonwealth Foundation, for financial support for this Consultation*

### **3. List of Persons Attending**

Hon PJ Patterson - former Prime Minister, Jamaica

Mr. Farooq Sobhan - Director of Bangladesh Enterprise Institute, former Foreign Secretary, Bangladesh

HE Burchell Whiteman - High Commissioner, Jamaica

Mr. Mark Allen - IMF

Mr. Gonzalo Fanjul - Senior Policy Advisor at Oxfam International

Ms. Meera Sethi - International Organisation on Migration

Mr. Cyrus Rustomjee - Director Economic Affairs Division, Commonwealth Secretariat

Mr. Vijay Krishnaravan - Deputy Director, Commonwealth Foundation

Prof. Nigel Harris - University College, London

Prof. John Oucho - Nairobi Centre for Migration Research and University of Warwick

Ms. Bella Bird - Head of Governance and Social Development Group, DFID

Prof. Richard Skeldon – DFID

Dr. Roli Degazon-Johnson - Commonwealth Secretariat

Ms Peggy Vidot - Commonwealth Secretariat

Ms. Constance Vigilance - Commonwealth Secretariat

Mr. Alan Smith - HSBC

Sir Ronald Sanders - Ramphal Centre

Mr. Gordon Baker - Ramphal Centre

Dr. Keith Nurse - Director, Shridath Ramphal Centre for International Trade Law, Policy and Services, Barbados

Mr. Bela Hovy - Chief of Migration, Population Division, UN, New York

Dr. Sadhana Manik Manik - South African gender specialist, University of KwaZulu-Natal

Mr. Ramesh Joshi - Deputy Secretary General, All India Federation of Teachers Organisations

Prof. Aderanti Adepoju - Chief Exec, Human Resources Development Centre, University of Lagos

Ms Debra Hamilton – Chair, PA

Miss Tamara Whelan – Rapporteur

Miss Alex Corbet-Milward – Assistant Co-ordinator

Mr. Richard Bourne Secretay, Ramphal Centre

Mrs. Patsy Robertson – Chair, Ramphal Centre

Miss Harjinder Hullen – Administrator, Ramphal Centre

#### **4. Agreed terms of reference following Warwick consultation**

Ramphal Commission on Migration and Development

*Terms of reference agreed with Commissioners following Warwick University consultation,  
29-30 October 2009*

##### Introduction

The overall purpose of this Commission, due to work in 2010 and 2011, and reporting to Commonwealth Heads of Government at their meeting in November 2011, is to recommend strategies for Commonwealth governments and actors which will maximise the benefit of cross-border migration for the pro-poor development of developing states, for individuals and communities.

It will take account of global and Commonwealth work already undertaken, such as the Human Development Report, 2009, with its evidence of large-scale internal migration, and migration across the boundaries of neighbouring states. It will remember the Commonwealth and global commitment to Millennium Development Goals. It will avoid duplication, while encouraging Commonwealth states to improve their collection of data and information about migration. It will be cognisant both of immigration policies of governments, and of undocumented migration.

It will maintain a continuous dialogue with Commonwealth institutions as the work progresses, while being mindful of its own independence and exploiting its own expertise. It will stress the enormous importance of the Commonwealth for advocacy, its experience in the movement of peoples, and appreciate the complexity of its migratory relationships. It will stimulate Commonwealth-wide discussion.

##### Terms of Reference

1. The Commission will examine the human dimensions of migration, and make appropriate recommendations to improve the development advantage, and diminish any disadvantage.
2. In particular the Commission will consider brain drain, brain waste and brain circulation and, having regard to the need for pro-poor development, will consider the situation of unskilled migrants, gender issues, and the scope for improving training in destination countries.
3. The Commission will consider the potential for a set of principles governing migration policy within the Commonwealth, recognising that migration policy is a matter for states and that citizens have a right to migrate; such principles may be designed to protect the rights of migrants, and to promote ethical recruitment.

4. Building on the recent “Respect and Understanding” report by the Commonwealth, the Commission will recommend ways in which governments may challenge xenophobia in their countries, promote understanding of the causes and benefits of migration, and act to prevent perceptions of unfairness in poor host communities. It will seek “win-win” solutions.
5. The Commission will pay particular attention to problems arising from environmentally-induced migration, both for environmentally-fragile states and their neighbours, and advise the Commonwealth how these may be mitigated, and the threatened communities assisted.
6. The Commission will recommend how diasporas, and traditional connections between Commonwealth states, may provide greater benefit for the development of member states.
7. In particular the Commission will consider how transaction costs in remittance flows between families may be reduced, how community-based and sector-specific organisations may be encouraged, and how a positive relationship between migration, development and the trade in goods and services may be stimulated by governments and the private sector.
8. The Commission will make specific recommendations to assist small states and less developed countries ( LDCs ) which have suffered excessive out-migration of expensively trained persons, and have yet to benefit significantly from return migration or diasporic investment.
9. The Commission will, where appropriate, recommend particular Commonwealth strategies or programmes of either a multilateral or bilateral kind – for instance protocols or codes of the kind devised for school teachers and health workers, or programmes of targeted managed migration such as are current between some Caribbean countries and the US and Canada, and between South Pacific islands and Australia and New Zealand.
10. The Commission will present a vision statement for migration policy within the Commonwealth for the next decade, which may influence policy at the global level also.

#### Process

It is proposed that the Commission will divide its terms of reference into blocks of work, on which reports can be prepared at intervals, maintaining a continuous dialogue with Commonwealth institutions and governments. For example it could be possible to group the terms as follows: 1,2,6,7; 5,8; and 3,4,9,10.

*Endorsed by the Annual General Meeting,  
Ramphal Centre Committee, London  
19 November, 2009*